

HALACHIC AND HASHKAFIC ISSUES IN CONTEMPORARY SOCIETY

SERIES 2: 19 - KARPAS OU ISRAEL CENTER - SPRING 2022

A] KARPAS - THE WORD

A1] KARPAS IN TANACH - FABRIC

1. חור כרפס ותכלת אֶחָזוּ בְּחַבְלֵי-בָוֶץ וְאַרְגָּמָן עַל-גְּלִילֵי כֶסֶף וְעִמּוּדֵי שֵׁשׁ מִטּוֹתָן זָהָב וְכֶסֶף עַל רִצְפַּת בַּהֲטֹ-שֵׁשׁ וְזָר וְסֻחָרֹת.

אסתר א:ו

The word karpas¹ appears once in Tanach - describing the fabrics hanging in the palace of Achashverosh.

2. (ו) חור כרפס ותכלת – מיני צגדים לצעונים פירם להם למצעות.

רש"י אסתר א:ו

Rashi explains that chur, karpas and techelet were colored fabrics draped over beds.

3. (ו) חור כרפס ותכלת - כל יריעה של קלעי חזר גינת ציתן סביב היתה מג' מראות אלו. חור - צמר לבן ... וכרפס - ירוק ככרתי. ותכלת ידוע (והן סימני מראות השלום שאין צבא האודם שהוא סי' מראה הדם והמלחמה)

רד"ל אסתר א:ו

Redal² understands that they were colored hangings around the palace. Chur is white, karpas is green and techelet is blue - all colors which project peace and security.

A2] KARPAS AS FABRIC IN OTHER ANCIENT LANGUAGES

SANSKRIT: Karpasa - the cotton tree (कर्पास)

Karpasa is a Sanskrit³ word referring to the 'Levantine cotton tree' a species of cotton from the Malvaceae (mallows) family of flowering plants, and is used throughout Ayurvedic literature such as the Caraka-samhita. It is known as Karpasa or Karpasi. The word Karpasa as an adjective literally translates to 'made of cotton, cottony'. The official botanical name is *Gossypium herbaceum* and is commonly known in English as 'Indian cotton' or 'common cotton'

FARSI: Karpas - fine white linen

GREEK: Karpasos - κάρπασος - cotton⁴. This Septuagint in Esther 1:6 translates כרפס as karpasinos (the adjective of karpasos)⁵.

LATIN: Carbasus - cotton, the sail of a ship (made from linen?)

1. There are many resources on line about karpas. See for instance ins<https://www.torahmusings.com/2014/04/karpas/>, <https://halachipedia.com/index.php?title=Karpas>, <http://www.gevaryahu.com/Karpas2.pdf>, <https://www.yeshiva.co/midrash/28630>

2. R. David b. Yehuda Luria - 19C Lithuania

3. Karpasa refers to "cotton", according to the Brhatsamhita (chapter 5), an encyclopedic Sanskrit work written by Varahamihira mainly focusing on the science of ancient Indian astronomy. See <https://www.wisdomlib.org/definition/karpasa>. Karpasa is also the name of *Gossypium herbaceum* and similar plants in ancient Bengali, Vanavksa, Marathi and other languages.

4. For references to this in ancient Greek and Latin see <http://www.perseus.tufts.edu/hopper/text?doc=Perseus:text:1999.04.0063:entry=carbasus-cn>

5. The Septuagint translates the ketonet passim of Tamar (2 Shmuel 13:18) as karpotos (a tunic reaching to the waist). The ketonet pasim of Yosef (Genesis 37:3) is translated by Symmachus (2nd century CE) as karpotos. However, the Septuagint translate the ketonet pasim of Yosef as *chitona poikilon* - a colored garment.

A3] KARPAS AS A VEGETABLE

INDO-EUROPEAN root: k-r-p = to gather, pluck⁶. English related words: harvest, carpet⁷

PERSIAN/FARSI: Karafs⁸ - کرفس - celery or parsley⁹

GREEK: Karpos - καρπός - fresh raw vegetable

B] KARPAS IN THE TALMUD

Karpas is NOT mentioned by Chazal in connection Seder. It is however mentioned in connection with the agricultural laws.

4. הפיגם, והירבוזין השוטים, והחלגלוגית, כוסבר שבהרים, והכרפס שבנהרות, והגרגר של אפר - פטורין מן המעשרות ונלקחין מכל אדם בשביעית, שאין כיוצא בהם נשמר ...

משנה מסכת שביעית פרק ט משנה א

River karpas¹⁰ is mentioned in a list of vegetables which are exempt from ma'aser and can be purchased freely during Shemita since they are not guarded but grow wild.

5. מהו כרפס שבנהרות? רבי יוסי בר חנינה אמר פיטרוסלין.

תלמוד ירושלמי (ונציה) מסכת שביעית פרק ט דף לח טור ג ה"א

The Talmud Yerushalmi associates karpas with a vegetable - pitrozin or parsley¹¹.

6. והכרפס של נהרות - שקורין בלעז קירשו"ן [שחליים] אצל של גנה חשוב הוא. ויש אומרים כרפס - אפי"א [כרפס, מין סלרין] וכן שמעתי, אצל נראה שאינה גדילה בנהרות.

רש"י סוכה לט:

Rashi identifies river karpas as 'cresson' - cress¹² or 'apie' - wild celery¹³

• Professor Felix understands that this identification with parsley is mistaken and that 'pitrosilin' was a more general name for a number of plants¹⁴. Rather, he associates this 'river karpas' with הביצות כרפס which is *Apium nodiflorum* or fool's watercress¹⁵.

7. כרפס - אמר רבי יוסי בר חנינה: כרים של פסים.

מגילה יב.

The Bavli mentions the word karpas once¹⁶ in connection with the Megila and understands it to be a composite word - kar(im) & pas(im)¹⁷: cushions of fine wool.

8. כרים של משי. וטעם דרשה זו בכלל יתבאר עפ"י מש"כ צעלי הלשון שאין שורש בלשון הקודש יותר מג' אותיות. ועל המרובעים והמחומשים יאמר בצחור¹⁸ (סוף מאמר ד') שהם מלשונות אחרות. ויש אומרים שהם מורכבים, וכפי הנראה הדעה הזאת האחרונה קצלו גם חז"ל. שכן מלינו להם כמה וכמה דרשות עפ"י הרכבת מלים אחדות צתיבה אחת מרובעת ומחומשת. וכמו שדרשו (יומא כח: דמשק - דולה ומשקה, ביב ד: אצרך - בא רך (נדב סא: שטענו - שוע טוי ונוז, והרבה כהנה. ואף הכא דריש עפ"י כלל זה.

תורה תמימה הערות אסתר פרק א הערה סא

The Torah Temima suggests that the Hebrew language does not have a root structure with more than 3 consonants. As such, any work with a 4 letter root (such as karpas) or a 5 letter root (such as shatnez) is a loan word from a foreign language. Chazal routinely darshen these words as compound words.

6. See the *American Heritage Dictionary* (1969) p. 1522.

7. Because it was made of unraveled, "plucked" fabric.

8. Prof. Yehuda Felix, *Hatzomeach Vehachai BeMishna* p 90.

9. According to Prof. Guggenheimer (in *The Scholar's Haggadah*), the words *karpas* (fine white linen) and *karafs* (celery) are both words in Farsi. He suggests that, when the vowel-points for the mediaeval song 'kadesh, urchatz' were added, the writer associated the consonants k-r-p-s with the Megila, so he vocalized them *karpas* rather than *karafs*. However, that ignores the likelihood that the word came from the Greek - *karpos*, meaning a fresh vegetable

10. The Steinsaltz Mishna commentary identifies river karpas as *apium graveolens* or celery, from the Latin and Greek selinon - celery.

11. The word "parsley" is a merger of Old English *petersilie* (which is identical to the contemporary German word for parsley: *Petersilie*) and the Old French *peresil*, both derived from Medieval Latin *petrosilium*, from Latin *petroselinum*, which is the latinization of the Greek *petroselinon* - 'rock-celery' from *petra* - rock/stone and *selinon* - celery.

12. *Lepidium* - a genus of plants in the mustard/cabbage family, *Brassicaceae*. It includes familiar species such as garden cress, maca, and dittander. General common names include peppergrass, pepperweed, and peppercress.

13. Celery (*Apium graveolens*) is a marshland plant in the family *Apiaceae* that has been cultivated as a vegetable since antiquity.

14. For instance, see *Yerushalmi Kilayim* 1:4 (27a) which describes the cross breed of 'zargon' and 'lefe' as 'pitrosilinon'.

15. This is a flowering plant found in ditches or streams. It is found all across Israel - see <https://www.wildflowers.co.il/hebrew/plant.asp?ID=1126>

16. The Bavli (*Avoda Zara* 28a) mentions the vegetable *karpasa* as a medical remedy. See also *Ketubot* 61a. This is another hint at the Seder that our ancestors in Egypt were afflicted and needed healing. Some say that the *karpas* comes to offset the effects of the maror - just like the *refua* comes before the affliction - *Orchot Chaim* 25.

17. Once Chazal make the connection with 'pasim', this invokes the *ketonet pasim* of Yosef (*Bereishit* 37:3) and of Tamar (*Shmuel* 2 13:18-19), both of which were torn in tragedy.

18. *Sefer Bachur* on Hebrew grammar by R. Eliyahu Bocher Levita (16C Italy).

C] KARPAS - THE SYMBOLISM

C1] 600,000 TOILED

- Some Rishonim¹⁹ write that karpas²⁰ should be used, because its Hebrew name alludes to the 600,000 men put to hard labor in Egypt. כרפס = ס' פרך

C2] YOSEF'S COAT

- As we saw above, the word karpas is found in Megilat Esther meaning a fine, richly colored fabric. There is a connection with karpas and Yosef's multicolored coat. The brothers dipped the coat in blood to convince Ya'akov that Yosef had died and this set into motion the events that brought about the slavery in Egypt.

9. פסים - לשון כלי מלת, כמו (אסתר א:ו) כַּרְפָּס וְתַלְמִית, וכמו (שמואל ב' יג:יח) כְּתֹנֶת (ה) פְּסִים דתמר ואמנון.

רש"י בראשית לז:ג

Rashi links the fine cloth (milat²¹) coat of Yosef with the karpas in Megilat Esther.

- R' Shlomo Kluger²² deepens the link to the karpas at Seder²³ and explains that the dipping of the karpas re-enacts the dipping by the brothers of the coat of Yosef in blood. This is 'Act 1 Scene 1' describing how we went down to Egypt. The second dipping, of the marmor in the charoset, symbolizes the dipping of the hyssop in blood to put on the doorposts - how we left Egypt²⁴.

D] DIPPING AT THE SEDER

10. מזוג לו כוס שני, וכאן הבן שואל אביו. ואם אין דעת בבן אביו מלמדו. מה נשתנה הלילה הזה מכל הלילות? ... שבכל הלילות אנו מטבילין פעם אחת הלילה הזה שתי פעמים ...

משנה מסכת פסחים פרק י משנה ד

The Mishna includes within the Ma Nishtana a question as to why we dip²⁵ twice at the Seder.

11. הביאו לפניו מטבל בחזרת (רש"י - כלומר אם אין שם ירק אחר מטבל החזרת צהרסת ואוכל) עד שמגיע לפרפרת הפת (רש"י - קודם שיגיע לאותה חזרת שהוא אוכל אחר המצה שהוא מצרך עליה על אכילת מרור). הביאו לפניו מצה וחזרת וחרוסת ושני תבשילין ...

משנה מסכת פסחים פרק י משנה ג

The Mishna describes the order of the Seder and refers to chazeret (marmor) twice - once at the beginning of the Seder for a dipping and then again with the matza for the mitzva of marmor.

12. אמר ריש לקיש: זאת אומרת מצות צריכות כוונה. כיון דלא בעידן חיובא דמרור הוא דאכיל ליה - בבורא פרי האדמה הוא דאכיל ליה, ודילמא לא איכוון למרור - הלכך בעי למהדר לאטבולי לשם מרור. דאי סלקא דעתך מצוה לא בעיא כוונה - למה לך תרי טיבולין? והא טביל ליה חדא זימנא: ממאי? דילמא לעולם מצות אין צריכות כוונה, ודקאמרת תרי טיבולין למה ליה - כי היכי דליהוי היכירא לתינוקות. וכי תימא: אם כן לישמעין שאר ירקות: אי אשמעינן שאר ירקות הוה אמינא: היכא דאיכא שאר ירקות הוא דבעינן תרי טיבולין, אבל חזרת לחודא - לא בעי תרי טיבולין. קמשמע לן: דאפילו חזרת בעינן תרי טיבולין כי היכי דליהוי ביה היכירא לתינוקות.

פסחים קיד:

The Gemara explains that the Mishna is dealing with the unusual case where a person has only 'chazeret' to use for both the first dipping (which the Gemara refers to as 'borei peri ha'adama') and the second dipping (of the marmor in the charoset). Even so, we will still dip twice since the purpose of the TWO dippings is so that the children will ask questions. However, it is clear that, if possible, one should use a different 'adama' vegetable for the first dipping.

19. Rokeach, Kol Bo, Manhig #60, Orchot Chaim 25, Maharil, Ravan.

20. Some say that the karpas should look like straw - *zecher leteven* - Rokeach 283, Sefer HaOrah 87, Maharil Hilchot Haggada.

21. From the Greek mellos - sheep. See Megila 12a and the statement of Chazal in Shabbat 10b - 'A person should never discriminate among his sons even to the extent of a thread [of a garment] weighing only two sela'im of milat, similar to that which Ya'akov gave to Yosef but not to the other brothers. This gift made the brothers jealous and caused our forefathers to go down to Egypt.'

22. In his commentary on the Haggada, Yeriot Shlomo, he quotes the Shu't Maharshal 88 (16C Poland) who writes 'one should take the afkoman as it is wrapped in a cloth, put it behind his back, walk four cubits in his house and say, 'Our forefathers walked so.'

23. The link between karpas at Seder and the coat of Yosef is mentioned much earlier in the Rishonim - see Rabbeinu Manoach (14C Provence) on Mishne Torah Hilchot Chametz U'matza 8:2. See also Simchat HaRegal (by the Chida) on *karpas* and Ben Ish Chai (Year 1 Tzav).

24. He also links this with the Gemara Pesachim 65b which explains the the people who bring their korban Pesach home on Erev Pesach slung over their backs and Rashi explains - like Yishmaeli traders, again symbolizing the sale of Yosef. Some link the two dippings to the two dippings of the hyssop to put blood on the two doorposts.

25. The Chatam Sofer understands that, even though the children have read the Torah, the karpas dipping will stimulate a question since it is NOT written in the Torah!

13. פשיטא, היכא דאיכא שאר ירקות - מברך אשאר ירקות בורא פרי האדמה ואכיל, והדר מברך על אכילת מרור ואכיל. היכא דליכא אלא חסא, מאי? אמר רב הונא: מברך מעיקרא אמרור בורא פרי האדמה ואכיל, ולבסוף מברך עליה על אכילת מרור ואכיל. מתקיף לה רב חסדא: לאחר שמיילא כריסו הימנו חוזר ומברך עליה?! אלא אמר רב חסדא: מעיקרא מברך עליה בורא פרי האדמה ועל אכילת מרור ואכיל, ולבסוף אכיל אכילת חסא בלא ברכה. בסורא עבדי כרב הונא, ורב ששת בריה דרב יהושע עבדי כרב חסדא. והלכתא כוותיה דרב חסדא. רב אחא בריה דרבא מהדר אשאר ירקות, לאפוקי נפשיה מפלוגתא.

פסחים קיד:

If a person has two different vegetables, the Gemara says that they should make 'haadama' on the first and 'al achilat marror' on the second. If they only have marror, the Gemara debates whether the 'al achilat marror' should be on the first or the second eating. Rav Huna splits the berachot and only says 'al achilat marror' on the second eating. Rav Chisda makes both berachot on the first eating since a person cannot initially 'fill their stomach' with the vegetable and only later make the beracha on the mitzva! It appears from this that a significant amount of vegetable should be eaten the first time around (what we call karpas)! Because of the halachic uncertainty as to the beracha, the Gemara concludes that a person should always find a different vegetable (ie other than marror) for the first dipping.

14. מה נשתנה הלילה הזה מכל הלילות שבכל הלילות אנו מטבילין פעם אחת, הלילה הזה שתי פעמים. מתקיף לה רבא: אטו כל יומא לא סגיא דלא מטבלא חדא זימנא? אלא אמר רבא, הכי קתני: שבכל הלילות אין אנו חייבין לטבל אפילו פעם אחת, הלילה הזה שתי פעמים. מתקיף לה רב ספרא: חיובא לדרדקי? אלא אמר רב ספרא, הכי קתני: אין אנו מטבילין אפילו פעם אחת הלילה הזה שתי פעמים.

פסחים קטז.

Later, the Gemara clarifies the wording of the Ma Nishtana. Dipping twice at Seder is not an obligation²⁶ but is something we do to stimulate the children to ask questions.

E] WHEN DID 'KARPAS' APPEAR IN THE SEDER?

- As noted above, 'karpas' does not appear in the Mishna or Gemara as part of the Seder.

15. ומביאין מיני ירקות כגון חמא או חסא או גרגירא או כרפס או כוסברתא.

סדר רב עמרם גאון (הרפנס) סדר פסח

The earliest connection of karpas to the Seder is in the siddur of Rav Amram Gaon (9th century Bavel). He lists a number of example of vegetables to be used for the first dipping. One of these is karpas²⁷.

- The order of the Seder at the beginning of the Haggada - 'Kadesh U'rchatz' etc first appeared in Machzor Vitri in the 11th century²⁸. So the custom stems at least from the school of Rashi, and may have been recording a much older custom.
- Rashi is also the first known source to connect the karpas with the ketonet pasim of Yosef - see above.

F] WHAT ARE WE TELLING THE CHILDREN?

It is clear from the Gemara that the dipping of karpas is to stimulate the children to ask the question 'why are we dipping now'. But what is the answer?

F1] WE'RE DIPPING BECAUSE WE ARE 'BNEI CHORIN'

16. ופירשו רש"י ורשב"ם צמשה דטיבול ראשון הוי היכירא לפי שאין בני אדם רגילין לאכול ירק קודם סעודה. ור"כ צסמ"ג (טשין מא קיח:3) ואחריהם נמשך רבינו. והתשובה לתינוקות הוא דהטיבול שקודם הסעודה הוא דרך חירות בני חורין שמטבילין קודם סעודה להמשיך תאות המאכל ...

ב"ח אורח חיים סימן תעג

The Bach brings one understanding from Rashi and Rashbam²⁹. When the children ask 'why are we dipping before the meal even starts', the answer is because we are acting like upper class free people who would eat dips before the meal to stimulate their appetite³⁰.

26. We do not say a bircat hamitzva on the karpas. But see the Rambam below.

27. This list then appears in a number of later sefarim, such as R. Yehonatan HaCohen of Lunel (on Rif Pesachim 116a Mishna 4). Sefer HaMinhag of R. Avraham b. Natan Hayarchi (also 12th century Provence) lists karpas as the primary choice, writing: 'he takes a vegetable like karpas, or any other vegetable'.

28. The Machzor Vitri was composed by R. Simcha b. Shmuel of Vitri (d 1105), who was a student of Rashi. The Machzor is already cited in the 12th Century by Sefer HaYashar of Rabbeinu Tam.

29. This reason is also given by the Maharil.

30. Other poskim add that, in addition to serving as an appetizer, we pamper ourselves by dipping in salt water or vinegar, which enhances flavor.

F2] WE'RE DIPPING BECAUSE WE ARE HUNGRY

17. ולי נראה דהתשובה היא לפי שעדיין לא הגיע זמן הסעודה, דצעינן למימר תחלה אגדתא והלילה. על כן אנו מטבילין עכשיו לטעימה צעלמא לפני הסעודה שלא לשהות כל אותו הזמן צלי אכילה כל עיקר.

ב"ח אורח חיים סימן תעג

The Bach's preferred reason is that we are dipping because we are hungry and it's a long time until dinner!

F3] WE'RE DIPPING NOW TO SHOW THAT THE NEXT DIPPING IS A MITZVA

18. ומהר"ל מפראג (גבורות ה' פרק 6) האריך לפלפל בזה וכתב שלדעתו הטיבול הראשון הוא צא כדי שיבא ניכר כשעושים הטיבול השני שהוא לשם מלוא מרור. שאם לא היה הטיבול הראשון לא היה ניכר צאכילת מרור שהוא לשם מלוא. שהרי כל ימות השנה דרך לטבל צפרט בחזרת. אבל עכשיו שואלין על טיבול שני שצתוך הסעודה למה לן עוד טיבול אחר? וישבו להם שצריכים טיבול משום מלוא מרור וטיבול ראשון כדרך כל ימות השנה. ולקמן צסימן תפ"ג (עמ' קמח ס"א ד"ה ובה) כתבתי שזהו דעת הרי"ף (פג) צפירוש הסוגיא עיין שם.

ב"ח אורח חיים סימן תעג

The Bach then brings the position of the Maharal³¹ who understands that people normally dip vegetables during a meal. So we dip the karpas (which is the normal dipping) so that when we dip the marror, the children will ask what THAT dipping is for, since we already dipped once. The answer is that the second dipping is for the mitzva of marror.

F4] WE'RE DIPPING NOW TO COVER THE 'HA'ADAMA' BERACHA FOR THE MARROR

19. וה"ר יוסף טוב עלם כתב צסדרו למה שאר ירקות צאין תחלה? לפטור חזרת מצרכה ראוייה לה. וליתא! דהא משום היכירא צאין ולא שייך כאן חבילות אלא צתרי מילי. ועוד דרצ חסדא מצרך שתיבן אחזרת. ועוד דמשמע דלא פטר ליה פת ושמא אינו מחשיבו פרפרת הפת כיון שאינו אוכל ממנו אלא כזית.

תוספות קטו. ד"ה והדר אכיל חסא בלא ברכה

Tosafot quotes R. Yom Tov Bonfils³² who understands that we eat the karpas in order to make a beracha 'borei peri ha'adama' since he rules that it is not possible to make two berachot together on the marror³³ ('ha'adama' and 'al achilat marror') since this would be considered 'chavilot' - inappropriately loading mitzvot together. Tosafot reject this reasoning on the basis that the principle 'ein osin mitzvot chavilot chavilot' only applies if there are two separate mitzvot loaded onto one action - such as bentching and kiddush on the same cup of wine. Tosafot also reject any suggestion that the marror might need its own 'adama' since they rule that it is certainly covered by the hamotzi just before³⁴.

• Nevertheless, that final point which is rejected by Tosafot is in fact proposed by other poskim. The marror is not clearly coming as part of the meal but as a separate mitzva. As such, it may indeed NOT be covered by the hamotzi. Therefore, we need to 'engineer' a 'borei pri ha'adama' beracha earlier in the meal to cover the marror later.

F5] WE'RE DIPPING NOW TO TO ADD ANOTHER DIFFERENCE AMONG MANY

20. אלא העיקר דהכיכר הוא צטיבול ראשון והכונה לעשות שינויים שישאלו, ומתוך כך יצואו לשאלו צשאר דצרים. ואף על פי שאין לנו להשיב לשאלתם למה טובלין מקמי סעודה, מכל מקום מתוך כך יתעוררו לשאלו צשאר השינויים שרואים שמוזגין כוס שני מקמי סעודה

פרי חדש אורח חיים סימן תעג סעיף ו

The Pri Chadash understands that we do not have to answer the children specifically about the first dipping, but this behavior, in conjunction with other unusual actions at the Seder, such as the second cup of wine, will provoke the children to ask even more.

G] WASHING FOR KARPAS

G1] WASHING ON WET FOODS GENERALLY

21. אמר רבי אלעזר אמר רב אושעיא: כל שטיבולו במשקה - צריך נטילת ידים.

פסחים קטו.

Chazal enacted a rabbinic halacha that if a person eats food which is dipped into liquid they must first wash their hands.

31. See also Taz OC 473:7 who has the same understanding.

32. R. Yom Tov's opinion appears in the Yotzrot to Shabbat HaGadol s.v. *ein aroch*.

33. Others write that the maror should not receive two berachot since it is a symbol of oppression, just like we do not call up two people for the tochacha reading.

34. The first section of that Tosafot argues that the maror IS covered by the beracha hamotzi since it is considered (and called) *parperet hapat*.

A Brief Introduction to the Levels of Tumah³⁵

Av HaTumah - a source of Tumah:	eg dead body, a person who is tamei met, metzora, nidda/zav, sheretz ³⁶ .
Rishon LeTumah - a primary recipient of Tumah:	eg a person, kli or food that touched an Av HaTumah.
Sheni LeTumah - a secondary recipient of Tumah:	eg food (not people or kelim) that touched a Rishon LeTumah.

22. כל שטיבולו במשקין. כגון ירק צכותה³⁷ או בחומץ צריך נטילת ידים משום משקה. שהידים שניות – וכל הפוסל את התרומה מטמא משקים להיות תחלה.

רשב"ם שם

The halacha of washing on dipped foods is based on a number of halachic principles in the laws of taharat:

(i) Chazal enacted that 'stam yadim' - hands which had not been specifically guarded against touching tamei objects - have a rabbinic din of 'Sheni LeTumah' - a second degree tumah. As such, they will invalidate Teruma³⁸ or Kodshim (which, due to their kodesh status, are more susceptible to contract tumah). Stam Yadayim will not however transmit tumah to regular food - chulin.

(ii) As a separate rabbinic gezeira, since there are liquids which have a status of 'Av HaTumah' (eg the bodily fluids of a Zav) Chazal were stricter in the laws of tahara with liquids than with solids. In particular Chazal often designated liquids as on a higher level of tumah than the corresponding solid. Normally something touching tumah will contract a LOWER level of received tumah (eg Rishon to Sheni). However, Chazal enacted that a liquid touching a Sheni LeTumah will actually contract a HIGHER level of received tumah and will become (at least rabbinically) a Rishon LeTumah. As such, when Stam Yadayim (which are Sheni LeTumah) come into contact with liquids they make them Rishon.

(iii) As such, although Stam Yadayim will not transmit tumah to chulin solid food, if they touch liquids (even chulin) they will make them Rishon Letumah. These tameh liquids will in turn pass on tumah to the chulin food to make it Sheni!

23. א כל האוכל הפת שמברכין עליו המוציא צריך נטילת ידים תחלה וסוף. ואף על פי שהיא פת חולין ואף על פי שאין ידיו מלוכלכות ואינו יודע להן טומאה לא יאכל עד שיטול שתי ידיו. וכן כל דבר שטיבולו במשקין צריך נטילת ידים תחילה.

רמב"ם ברכות פרק ו הלכה א

The Rambam³⁹ rules this halacha in the same place that he rules on washing for bread, and clearly equates the two.

24. ולפי זה נראה דאין לצרף על אותה נטילה ... וכ"ש אגן שאין אנו נזהרין מלטמאות טמאין ומלאכול אוכלין טמאין ואין אנו צריכין לאותה נטילה, והמצדד כרי זה מצדד צרכה לצטלה ...

תוספות פסחים קטו. ד"ה כל שטיבולו

Tosafot reject the comparison to washing for bread. The halacha to wash for bread is not only based on considerations of tahara, but also on a concept of kedusha at the meal and elevating the activity of eating to compare with that of the Cohanim in the Mikdash. For that reason, Tosafot rule that washing for food dipped in liquid does not require a beracha. This is especially true these days when the laws of tahara do not generally apply.⁴⁰

25. אם אוכל דבר שטיבולו באחד משבעה משקין שסימנם: י"ד שח"ט ד"ם (דהיינו: יין, דבש, שמן, חלב, טל, דם, מים) ולא נתגבגב, ואפילו אין ידיו נוגעות במקום המשקה, צריך נטילה בלא ברכה. הגב: ואפי' אינו מטבול רק ראש הירק או הפרי אפ"ה יטול בלא ברכה.

שולחן ערוך אורח חיים סימן קנח סעיף ד

The Shulchan Aruch rules that before eating dipped foods one must wash netilat yadim, but without a beracha. This is also the psak of the Rema. This applies to any⁴¹ food⁴² dipped⁴³ into one of the '7 liquids' - wine, honey, oil, milk, dew, blood⁴⁴ and water⁴⁵.

35. This summary is highly over-simplified. We looked at these issues in more details in our previous series on Tumah and Tahara including Cohanim on airplanes - see <https://rabbimanning.com/index.php/audio-shiurim/cji/>.

36. This is a brief list of some examples - there are almost 20 different Avot HaTumah!

37. Kutach is milk based and is therefore one of the 7 liquids.

38. This is one reason for the Rabbinic decree of washing for bread. Cohanim would often eat their grain Teruma as bread and would of course have to wash their hands for this since Stam Yadayim are Sheni LeTumah, which will invalidate Teruma. In order to strengthen this halacha, Chazal required that EVERYONE must wash their hands for ALL bread, even if chulin. In that way, even today when there is no real application for the laws of tahara, the halacha of washing for bread will remain known in preparation for the return of the Beit Mikdash and reestablishment of the laws of tahara. There are however other reasons for the halachic requirement to wash for bread, such as personal kedusha.

39. This is the position of most Rishonim, including Rashi, Rabbeinu Yona and the Rosh.

40. According to other Rishonim - including the Maharam MiRottenburg and the Ba'al Haltur - the entire halacha of washing for dipped food is NOT applicable today.

41. And not just vegetables as sometimes incorrectly thought.

42. Simply licking these liquids from one's fingers does not require netilat yadayim. Similarly, foods normally eaten with cutlery (eg cereal and milk or chicken in sauce) do not require washing even if eaten by hand (some poskim are stricter if they are actually eaten by hand). Wet foods normally eaten by hand would require washing even if eaten with cutlery.

43. It will also apply if the foods are pre-washed and still (halachically) wet eg washed grapes. 'Halachically wet' means wet enough that if you touched them with your finger, that finger could then make something else wet - *tofeach al menat lehatpiach*.

44. This would be relevant for those who are allowed to eat blood for health reason. Fish blood is not one of the 7 liquids - see Shulchan Aruch HaRav 158:4

45. Wine includes grape juice. Honey, in this context, this means bee's honey and not date honey. Oil includes only olive oil. Milk includes liquid butter or cheese. Water includes salt

This would therefore in principle apply to the following cases:

- Cookies dipped in milk.
 - Washed fruit which is still wet.
 - Cheese fondue.
 - Large pieces of vegetables in olive oil.
 - Cake dipped into coffee.
 - Apples dipped in honey.
 - Wet pickles.
 - Olives soaked in olive oil.
- Fries dipped in ketchup⁴⁶ would not require washing as ketchup is not one of the 7 mashkim. So too sushi dipped in soy sauce.⁴⁷

26. בלא ברכה. תוס' שם דס"ל דהאידנא א"י נטילה זו. אבל כל הגאונים ורוב הפוסקים הסכימו שגם האידנא נובג כמו פת ולריך ברכה וכן עיקר.

ביאור הגר"א אורח חיים סימן קנח סעיף ד

*The Vilna Gaon rules like the Rambam and other poskim who do require washing for dipped food WITH a beracha!*⁴⁸

27. (כ) בלא ברכה – כי יש מקלף הראשונים דכברי שלא הלרכו חכמים נט"י לדבר שטיבולו צמסקה חלא צימיהם שהיו אוכלים צטברה משא"כ עכשיו שכולנו טמאי מתים ולכך לא יברך ענט"י שספק צרכות להקל. והנה צמ"א הביא צשם הל"ה דהעולם נובגים שלא לטובל ויש להם על מה שיסמוכו היינו על מקלף הראשונים הנ"ל. אבל הרבה אחרונים החמירו מאד דצבר וכתבו דהעיקר כרוב הפוסקים דלריך נטילה מדינא אף צזה"ל. ועיין צביאור הגר"א שגם דעתו כן והחמיר מאד צזה שאף לריך לברך ע"ז. ולכן אף דהעולם אין נובגין לברך, עכ"פ אין להקל לאכול צלי נטילה. ולריך לזה כל דיני נטילה כמו לפת. ומ"מ צפחות מכזית נ"ל פשוט שאין להחמיר צזה כלל דאפי' צפת הרבה אחרונים מקילין וכנ"ל צמ"צ

משנה ברורה סימן קנח ס"ק כ

The Mishna Berura quotes the Magen Avraham who records that, these days, many people do not wash AT ALL for dipped food and rules that this is a legitimate opinion for those who rely on it. However, the Mishna Berura himself clearly rules that one SHOULD wash without a beracha.

- This is the psak of many Sefardi⁴⁹ poskim - Ben Ish Chai⁵⁰, Kaf Hachaim⁵¹, R. Ovadia Yosef.⁵² It is also the psak of the Chazon Ish⁵³.
- The Kitzur Shulchan Aruch⁵⁴ rules that this halacha should be followed by a Yorei Shamayim⁵⁵.
- The Aruch Hashulchan⁵⁶ brings a range of classic poskim who rule that the halacha of washing for dipped food does not apply at all today and that the custom is not to wash.⁵⁷

Other grounds for leniency include:

- Some poskim are more lenient with cooked liquids.⁵⁸
- Some poskim are more lenient if one will definitely not touch the liquid.
- Some poskim are more lenient where each piece of food is smaller than a kezayit.⁵⁹

G2] WASHING FOR KARPAS ON SEDER NIGHT

- According to those poskim who require washing on wet foods, there is no surprise that we wash for karpas. The unusual action at Seder is the dipping. The washing simply follows as a general halachic requirement.

28. נוטל ידיו לצורך טבול ראשון ולא יברך על הנטילה

שולחן ערוך אורח חיים הלכות פסח סימן תעג סעיף ו

The Shulchan Aruch requires one to wash⁶⁰ for karpas at Seder (as he requires all year) but not to make a beracha 'al netilat yadayim'⁶¹.

water - eg on Seder night, although, in principle, the water would still have to be drinkable.

46. The main ingredients of ketchup are tomatoes, sweeteners, vinegar, salt, spices, flavorings, onion and/or garlic.

47. R. Ovadia Yosef (Yalkut Yosef 158:7) rules that one must also wash for cake dipped in grain whisky, which is difficult to understand.

48. This is also the custom of the Yemenites.

49. See also <http://www.dailyhalacha.com/m/halacha.aspx?id=1562>

50. Tazria (16).

51. 158:13 and 25

52. See Yalkut Yosef 158

53. OC 25, 14 & 15 s.v. kasav bM"B. See other contemporary psakim in https://ohr.edu/this_week/insights_into_halacha/5106

54. 40:17

55. This raises the meta-halachic question of who classifies as a Yorei Shamayim and when.

56. OC 158:4

57. R. Eliezer Melamed in Peninei Halacha recommends washing but explains that many people are lenient not to wash at all due to the concept of 'safek derabbanan'. He writes that, in situations where there is an additional level of safek - eg small pieces of food - there is a *sfek sfeka* and even more reason to be lenient - see <http://ph.yhb.org.il/10-02-05/>

58. See Yalkut Yosef 158:11 for a discussion of whether one can rely on this.

59. Although on Seder Night we DO wash for karpas even though many have the practice to eat less than a kezayit - see below. Some poskim are lenient even with less than a kebeitza.

60. The normal halachot of washing for bread apply although some rule that one only needs to wash once on each hand. Some have a custom that other people should wash their hands on Seder night.

61. R. Eliezer Melamed rules that, if one mistakenly recites a blessing over this hand washing, this would not be a *beracha levatala*, since they acted in accordance with the majority of

29. (ו) (פמ"ג) נוטל ידיו לצורך טיבול ראשון. דכל שטיבולו צמשקה רריך נטילה. מכאן יש תוכחת מגולה לאותן שאין נזהרין בכל השנה לטיבול קודם שיאכל דבר שטיבולו צמשקה. דמה נשתנה הלילה הזה מכל הימים שבשנה?! ואם צא לטבר עזמו טפי זלילה זו ה"ל להזכר עכ"פ צ"י ימי התשובה שמהרים הכל לאכול פת של ישראל דוקא. אלא ודאי שאין כאן אלא חסרון זכירות ואין מדקדקים להשוות מידותיהם.

ט"ז אורח חיים סימן תעג ס"ק ו

The Taz is clearly very unhappy with those who wash for karpas but not the rest of the year, even between Rosh Hashana and Yom Kippur!! He sees this inconsistency as an open rebuke to people's lack of care concerning washing all year around.

- So according to those poskim who do NOT require washing on wet foods in in general, why would we do this a Seder?

30. וכיון שרריך לאכול הירקות ולטבל אותם, נהגו לטיבול ידיהם [ו]לצרך עליהם, משום דקי"ל כקלת פוסקים [ע"י פסחים קטו ע"א] שסוצרים כל דבר שטיבולו צמשקה רריך נטילה לטבר ידיו משום דמשקין עלולין לקבל טומאה. ואף על גב דצשאר ימות השנה אין נזהרין צזה, אפשר משום חיצת הרגל ושהוא טיבול של מלוח נהגו עזמן עכשיו צטברה יותר. ולכך נוטלין ידיהם ומצרכין על נטילת ידים לטיבול זזה, וכן נתפשט המנהג.

לבוש אורח חיים סימן תעג סעיף ו

The Levush (16C Poland) rules that the custom in his day was for people to wash on karpas AND to make a beracha on the washing! Even though this was not the common practice all year around, since people were excited about the Chag and also since this dipping is a 'mitzva', people adopt a higher level of stringency⁶²!

31. ואף מי שאינו נזהר בכל השנה בטיבולו במשקה לטיבול ידיו בפסח יטול ידיו. שהרי כמה שינויים אנו עושין בליל זה. וענין הטיבול הוא כדי שישאלו התנוקות למה זה טובלין קודם האכילה מה שאין דרך לעשות כן. דכבר נתבאר דהתורה הקפידה בליל זה על שאלת הבנים ...

ערוך השולחן אורח חיים סימן תעג סעיף יח

The Aruch HaShulchan explains that even people who do not normally wash on wet foods do so on Seder night so that the children will ask.

- The Netziv⁶³ explains that we do many things on Seder which are zecher leMikdash (such as eat marror and Korech). Washing for wet foods is another example of that⁶⁴.

H] WHAT VEGETABLE SHOULD WE USE FOR KARPAS?

- Any vegetable which is 'borei pri ha'adama' will be acceptable⁶⁵.
- The classic list of Rav Amram is lettuce⁶⁶, radish, rocket, karpas - celery⁶⁷/parsley, coriander.
- The Arizal writes that the minhag is to use karpas and one should not change this⁶⁸.
- Other minhagim include cabbage, beetroot, leek⁶⁹ and onion⁷⁰.
- When potatoes were introduced to Europe these became a popular option⁷¹.
- Some poskim rule not to use a food for karpas that is normally eaten outside the context of a meal – such as bananas⁷², pineapple and strawberry – since it is not clear that they are being used as appetizers.

poskim, including Levush and Gra, who require a beracha when washing hands for a food dipped in liquid. In such a case, they should be particular (unlike normally) to eat more than a kezayit of karpas, since a beracha is only said on washing to eat at least a kezayit. However, lechatchila, one should not make a beracha due to the principle of *safek berachot lehakel* - we rule leniently in cases of uncertainty about berachot. Furthermore, if one mistakenly recited a beracha over the first hand washing, they still make another beracha on the second hand washing for the matza. This is because (i) people are not careful about keeping their hands clean between the two washings; (ii) the time spent reciting the Haggada constitutes an interruption; and (iii) Chazal instituted two separate requirements to wash on Seder night.

62. Some also bring this as a hint of the halacha to be tahor on the regel. The kabbalists also quote the need to be extra careful in mitzvot on Seder night.

63. In his commentary on the Haggada, Imrei Shefer.

64. Some understand that we are concerned that, if we do not wash now, next year when the korban Pesach is brought, we may forget to wash and invalidate ourselves for the korban!

65. See Rambam commentary to Pesachim 10:3. A vegetable which was grown hydroponically will have the beracha 'shehakol' and is not valid for karpas. Some poskim rule that a vegetable grown in a pot inside the house is 'shehakol' (Chayei Adam 130 *haseder biktzara* 5).

66. We saw above that, bedieved, a vegetable which is also maror could be used.

67. Shu't Chatam Sofer 132 in the name of his teacher Rabbi Natan Adler says that the *apie* vegetable is celery. Machatzit haShekel (473:4) in name of medical books, and Shu't Bet Shearim 213 concur that karpas is celery. Halichot Shlomo writes that Rav Shlomo Zalman Auerbach when he was younger ate celery and in his later years had cucumber as Karpas.

68. Quoted by Od Yosef Chai Tzav 6, Kaf HaChaim 473:14, Chazon Ovadia (Pesach vol 2 pg 34).

69. Some choose beets (*silka*) or leeks (*karti*) as simanim for the same reason as on first night Rosh Hashana.

70. Raw onion presents a potential issue since its beracha may be shehakol in places where people do not usually eat onions raw.

71. There is an opinion that the vegetable must be raw or could be eaten raw. This would exclude potatoes, although the custom is not to be concerned for this - see Mikra'ei Kodosh p. 184-187; Siddur Pesach K'hilchtato 2:5:3. Although the Sefardi custom was to use celery, and some Ashkenazim used parsley, most Ashkenazim use neither celery nor parsley, because of the uncertainty about what beracha to make over them. In Ashkenazi communities these vegetables were not generally eaten raw, and consequently one who eats them raw should recite 'shehakol'. They would therefore NOT be suitable for karpas, which must be 'ha-adama'. Therefore, the custom in Ashkenazi became to eat cooked potatoes for karpas. In Middle Eastern and North African communities, where celery and parsley were eaten raw, everyone made 'ha-adama' over them.

72. R. Pinchas Teitz of Elizabeth NJ was reported to have been particular to use bananas to demonstrate that their beracha was 'ha-adama'.

I] WHAT SHOULD WE DIP THE KARPAS INTO?

- The two main minhagim are to dip into either salt water⁷³ or red⁷⁴ wine vinegar⁷⁵.
- Some Mizrachi (particularly Syrian, Indian and Iraqi) communities use lemon juice for karpas.
- We will see below that the Rambam dipped the karpas into charoset!
- Nevertheless, it would need to be one of the 7 halachic liquids, so not every option would work⁷⁶.

J] HOW MUCH KARPAS SHOULD ONE EAT?

J1] THE NOVEL SHITTA OF THE RAMBAM - KARPAS, KEZAYIT AND CHAROSET

מתחיל ומברך בורא פרי האדמה ולוקח ירק ומטבל אותו בחרוסת ואוכל כזית הוא וכל המסובין עמו, כל אחד ואחד אין אוכל פחות מכזית.	32.
---	-----

רמב"ם הלכות חמץ ומצה פרק ח הלכה ב

The Rambam rules that each person must eat MORE than a kezayit of karpas and dip it in charoset!

[ד] כזית זה אינו יודע מה טיבו. בשלמא מרור דאכילה כתיב זיה ואין אכילה פחות מכזית. אלא טיבול זה הראשון אינו אלא להתמיה התינוקות שיטאלו ... ובכל דכו סגי. שהרי זרכה כזאת אינה לריכה שיעור ויכול לזרך זורא פרי האדמה אכל שבו, רק שלא יזרך זרכה אחרונה אם לא יהיה כזית ... ובצורני שטעות סופר הוא שכתבו זכאן אחר 'ומטבל זחרוסת' מה שהיה ראוי להיות כתוב לקמן אחר 'ומטבל זחרוסת' דגזי מרור. ותדע שהרי לקמן גזי מרור לא הזכיר כלום מכזית. וזכה גזי ירק ראשון הלריך כזית וזמרור זכל שהוא ליכא איניש דטעי! דירק ראשון אינו אלא להתמיה התינוקות ומרור כתיב זיה אכילה, כ"ש גדול הדור כמוהו! ומבר"ם כתב והורה שאין לריך כזית זטיבול זה ואם אכל כזית יזרך אחר כך, ואף על פי שיש שכתב לאכול כזית ע"כ.	33.
---	-----

הגהות מיימוניות הלכות חמץ ומצה פרק ח הלכה ב

The Hagahot Maimonidot⁷⁷ cannot understand why the Rambam would require one to eat a kezayit of karpas, since this is not a mitzva of 'achila' which requires a kezayit. Rather, he suggests that it is a mistake in the manuscript copying of the Rambam and should have been inserted later concerning the eating of the marror. Since the Rambam requires both the karpas and the marror to be dipped in charoset, this confused the copyist!

- R. Soloveitchik⁷⁸ understood that the Rambam requires a kezayit of karpas since he understands it to be a mitzva of achila on Seder night. This is also why the Rambam requires the karpas to be dipped in charoset. The Rambam understand that ALL of the food required to be eaten on Seder night must be dipped in charoset. This is why he also required the MATZA to be dipped in charoset⁷⁹, and not only the marror! So too the karpas, as a mitzvat achila must be dipped in charoset and also at least a kezayit⁸⁰ must be eaten.
- For the Rambam, the 'heiker' to make the children ask is not the dipping and eating of karpas (which is a mitzva) but the removing of the Seder plate/table immediately after the karpas before the meal.

J2] LESS THAN A KEZAYIT - KARPAS, HEFSEK AND DOUBT

- Most Rishonim do not consider there to be a mitzva to eat karpas and, as such, there is no requirement to eat a kezayit.
- There are however some real doubts in hilchot berachot, including:
 - (i) Does the marror require its own 'borei peri ha'adama' or is it considered part of the meal and covered by hamotzi?

73. There are a number of interpretations as to what the salt water represents - the tears of slavery, tears that are shed over the destruction of the Beit Hamikdash, or the waters of the Red Sea through which the Jewish people crossed. Some link it to the destruction of Sodom which happen on 15 Nissan. R. Sar Shalom MiBelz is quoted in Ta'amei Haminhagim (522) as saying that the whole Jewish people needed to do tevila in a mikva before eating the koraban Pesach and the salt water resembles a mikve which has been over-used!

74. The Talmud Yerushalmi (Pesachim 10:3) quotes an opinion that the dipping in charoset commemorates the blood - *zecher ledam*. Charoset today is still made with red wine, and many Persian Jews dip the karpas into red-wine vinegar. Yemenite Jews dip the karpas into charoset made of raisin-wine or wine-vinegar (R. Yosef Kapach, Halichot Teyman (Jerusalem: 1987) p.21).

75. The Mordechai (13C France) suggests vinegar or wine. See Beit Yosef OC 473 who quotes these minhagim and observes that he discovered that some people use salt-water, indicating that this was a surprise to him. Presumably red wine vinegar was more available in Sefardi lands than Ashkenazi. It is also possible that Ashkenazim avoided dipping in a red liquid due to the blood libels, as later recorded by many Acharonim (Taz OC 472:11).

76. The Rambam's recipe for Charoset (commentary to Pesachim 10:3) is based in red wine vinegar (see also Rema OC 473:5), which is one of the 7 liquids, but lemon juice is not. Nevertheless, the custom is to wash for such a dipping (Shu't Mikraei Kodesh 39).

77. R. Meir b. Yekutiel HaKohen of Rothenburg (born c.1260). He was a talmid of the Maharam of Rothenburg, and personally attended Maharam during his years of captivity, until the latter's death in 1293.

78. Haggadat Siach HaGrid 5.

79. Hilchot Chametz U'Matza 8:8. The Ravad observes there that the requirement to dip the matza in charoset is 'hevel' - nonsense!

80. R. Moshe Sternbuch, Moadim U'Zmanim 7:183, notes an additional difference between Rambam's opinion and the opinion of Hagahot Maimoniot. According to Rambam, karpas is one of the mitzvot of the night and therefore requires haseibah (eating in a reclined position). According to Hagahot Maimoniot, there is no requirement to recline for karpas.

(ii) Can we use the ha'adama on the karpas to cover the marror or is the intervening recitation of the haggada and hallel considered a hefsek⁸¹?

(iii) Does the karpas require its own 'borei nefashot' or will it be covered by bircat hamazon. Again, can it be seen as part of the meal, either objectively, or because of the long interruption between karpas and the next food?

- The Maharil⁸² rules that, because of the doubts in hilchot berachot one should eat less than a kezayit of karpas.

34. נוטל ידיו לצורך טבול ראשון ולא יברך על הנטילה, ויקח מהכרפס פחות מכזית ומטבלו בחומץ ומברך בורא פרי האדמה ואוכל. ואינו מברך אחריו....

שולחן ערוך אורח חיים הלכות פסח סימן תעג סעיף ו

The Shulchan Aruch rules to eat less than a kezayit.

- One should have in mind when making the beracha on the karpas that one is also covering the marror.

35. (נג) פחות מכזית - לפי שזכזית יש ספק בצרכה אחרונה אם יברך אותה או לא. ע"כ טוב יותר שיאכל פחות מכזית שלא יהא צו חיוב כלל לכז"ע.

משנה ברורה סימן תעג ס"ק נג

The Mishna Berura explains that if one ate more than a kezayit of karpas there would be a doubt as to whether to make a beracha acharona. Therefore one should eat less than a kezayit so that one will definitely not need to make a beracha acharona on the karpas⁸³.

36. וכיון שאכילה זו אינה אלא להתמיה את התינוקות, לפיכך אין צריך כזית כשאר אכילות שבתורה שאינה נקראת אכילה בפחות מכזית. אלא אפילו במשהו די להתמיה התינוקות. (ואף מי שיושב יחידי ואין לפניו תינוקות שישאלו אותו אף על פי כן חייב צטיבול זה שלא חלקו חכמים).

שולחן ערוך הרב אורח חיים סימן תעג סעיף טו

The Shulchan Aruch Harav rules that, since we eat the karpas to make the children ask (and not as a mitzva of 'achila'), this can be achieved with even less than a kezayit.

K] DOES ONE LEAN FOR KARPAS?

- There are different opinions on whether one should lean when eating karpas⁸⁴.
- Some poskim rule not to lean since the karpas and salt water represents the slavery⁸⁵.
- Some poskim said one should lean since the karpas is one of the mitzvot of the night indicated freedom.⁸⁶
- Most Acharonim rule that leaning is not required but is permitted⁸⁷.

81. This may be linked to question of whether each of the cups of wine has its own beracha. According to those views that say each cup needs a separate beracha, is this because there is a hefsek in between, or because each cup is a separate mitzva (regardless of hefsek). According to the 'separate mitzva' approach, are the karpas and maror 'separate mitzvot' which would each require a 'borei peri ha'adama', irrespective of the hefsek? See Biur Halacha on 473:6 s.v. *ve'eino*.

82. Shu't Maharil 25. R. Ya'akov b. Moshe Levi Moelin (1365 - 1427) Germany.

83. If one ate more than a kezayit one should not make a beracha acharona - Mishna Berura 473:56. R. Hershel Schachter (Rav Schachter on the Haggadah pg. 70) rules that if a person is very hungry, they may continue to eat karpas (or some other vegetable) every so often. This way, they will not have a *hesech hada'at* between karpas and maror and borei nefashot will not be necessary.

84. The Ben Ish Chai (R. Yosef Chayim of Baghdad, 1833-1909), Parashat Tzav, writes that according to kabbala one must leave the karpas on the Seder plate even after he eats his portion of karpas. Rather than clear the karpas off the table, one should leave the karpas on the Seder plate at the table throughout the entire Seder.

85. Shiblei HaLeKet (92b) - R. Tzidkiya Ben Avraham, Italy (1230-1300)

86. Avudraham (Spain 14C). R. Moshe Sternbuch, Moadim U'Zmanim 7:183 says that the Avudraham agrees with the position of the Rambam on this.

87. This is since one may even lean for Maror if one chooses to - Beit Yosef 475, Magen Avraham, and Mishna Berura 475:14). Rabbi Chayim Palachi (Turkey, 1788-1868) in Chayim La'rosh rules that one should endeavor to satisfy both views by eating some karpas while reclining and some while sitting upright.